

REPORT TO THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: July 24, 2025

SUBJECT:

Case #251842 - 101 N. Center Street - Dyer's Café - Request approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) for Exterior Alterations

INTRODUCTION:

- Property owners Mark A. & Amanda G. McMinn are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) for façade modifications related to the existing hipped-roof canopy on the front façade (see Exhibit 3).
- The property, zoned CB: Central Business, is located on the west side of North Center Street on the Town Square (see Exhibit 1).

BACKGROUND:

- Wood shake shingles were added in the 1970s, 1980s, and 1990s to structures on the Square as part of restoration efforts, but are now considered inappropriate by the Guidelines as they give the Square a New England or Colonial look.
- The Historic District Commission (HDC) and the Board of Mayor and Aldermen (BMA) updated the Historic District Design Guidelines in January 2019 to better address canopies and awnings on the Square. As part of this update:
 - language was added to the Guidelines to state wood shake shingles and hip-roofed canopies are inappropriate; and
 - the Guidelines clarified it is appropriate to perform routine maintenance and minor repairs on existing canopies with inappropriate materials, such as cedar shake shingles; however, replacing over 50% of the existing materials is considered rehabilitation and requires a CofA from the HDC (Exhibit 9).

KEY POINTS:

1. The building is more than 100 years old and may have historical significance; however, inappropriate changes were made around 1975-1980 (Exhibit 8).

- The 1,260 square foot commercial building is located within the National Register District (see Exhibits 7 & 8). The building was constructed sometime between 1879 and 1905, depending on the source.
- The building is listed as a Non-Contributing Structure for Collierville's National Register District based on 2004 and 2021 surveys (see Exhibit 7).
- The wooden shingle covering on the solid, hip-roof roof canopy is inappropriate per the Guidelines (see Exhibit 9), and it is appropriate for it to be replaced.
- The 2004 Historic Survey notes there have been "abusive alterations" possibly in reference to the storefront's "broken shadow pediment."
- Evidence exists of a flat metal canopy was historically found on his building and shared with the building to the south (see Exhibit 6). If the HDC finds a flat metal canopy to be more appropriate, the motion will need to be amended.

2. The Town adopted changes to the Guidelines related to awning and canopy materials.

- The cedar shake shingle coverings on most of the canopies and awnings on the Square are deteriorating and are in need of repair or replacement.
- The changes to the Guidelines (Exhibit 9) adopted in January of 2019 say standing seam metal could be an appropriate replacement material for some awnings and canopies with shingle roofs provided:
 - i. the slope of the awning/canopy is not too high; and,
 - ii. it is not used on mansard or pent roof canopies.

3. The applicant is requesting to repair the deteriorated existing hipped-roof canopy structure with new shingles and decking (see Exhibit 3).

- The applicant states the wood shingles on the awnings have collapsed, and they plan to retain the existing hipped-roof canopy structure (see Exhibit 4).
- The applicant wants to remove the existing cedar shingles on the awning and install new asphalt shingles. Standing seam metal would be an alternative (see Exhibit 5).
- Standing seam metal is an appropriate finishing per the Guidelines for a canopy if the structure is non-historic or new construction (Exhibit 9).
- The Guidelines say replacing more than 50% of existing wood shingles is not appropriate, and the façade changes would need to fully comply with the Guidelines (Exhibit 9). More than 50% of the shingles would be replaced with this request.
- Asphalt shingle or cedar shake shingles awnings are prohibited according to the Historic District Guidelines (Exhibit 9).
- Exhibit 5 shows an alternative roofing material of metal, but it is not part of the cover letter and example motion. If the HDC finds metal to be more appropriate, the motion will need to be amended.
- The existing wood siding has been in place around 50 years and may have developed historic significance. Replacement siding, the HDC allows it to remain, must match the old in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual properties, and, where possible, materials.
- If the HDC allows the existing canopy to be retained, alterations will be made to the south end of the canopy to match the slope of the north end of the canopy. Drawings will need to be provided showing this. Additional posts may be needed for structural support and symmetry of design.
- Product and color details are needed for the roofing material.

4. Standing seam metal has been used on other buildings around the Square.

- The HDC approved in 2018 the use of high-quality standing seam metal for 114 East Mulberry (Collierville Magazine) to replace deteriorated cedar shake shingles on a sloped awning.
- The HDC approved in 2019 the use of standing seam metal on a large pent roof canopy at 116 East Mulberry Street, subject to conditions to ensure the material would be consistent with the Guidelines. The metal installed was not consistent with the HDC's conditions of approval. Staff worked with that property owner on bringing the awning into conformance with the HDC's conditions.
- Standing seam metal roofing was installed prior to 2018 on several other buildings older than 50 years facing the Square, such as 120 East Mulberry (Raven & Lilly) and 92 and 94 North Main Street.
- Standing seam metal can also be found on the new infill building at 50 North Main Street (John Green Realty).

5. Asphalt shingles have been used in other buildings around the Square, but they were installed prior to the 2019 Guidelines change. Examples in 110 and 132 East Mulberry St.

6. The most appropriate coverings over sidewalks per the HD Guidelines are fabric awnings and flat metal canopies. The property owner should use this opportunity to bring the façade fully into compliance with the Guidelines.

- Page 77 of the Guidelines says, "artificial sidings are not appropriate for traditional commercial

buildings. In addition to changing the original appearance of the building, artificial sidings may make maintenance more difficult because they may cover up potential moisture problems that can become more serious. Remove artificial siding and restore original building material, if possible. Most commercial buildings in the historic district are brick masonry." An image of this building and the adjoining building is on Page 77 with the caption reading, "Artificial siding hides original materials on a building and is not compatible to surrounding structures."

- If structurally possible, the applicant should consider removing the existing wood siding with the planned facade renovation and exposing the historic brick facades and windows.
- The property owner at 118 East Mulberry removed their pent roof canopy with a cedar shake shingles covering and replaced it with a contextual flat metal canopy.
- The Collierville Masonic Lodge (#152) at 106 North Main Street was approved for façade alterations and added a flat metal canopy to the front façade.
- The property owner of 99 N Center Street has requested to remove the noncompliant hipped roof to replace with fabric awning.

7. When commercial facades are renovated, the Town inspects buildings to ensure the building is being properly maintained.

8. The HDC should decide the following:

- whether replacement of more than 50% of the deteriorated wood shingles with Conditions of Approval for the design of hipped roof or asphalt shingles is appropriate; or,
- if standing seam metal (on the existing hipped-roof structure), a fabric awning, or flat metal canopy are determined to be more appropriate for this facade.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Staff cannot recommend approval of the request at this time because it is currently not consistent with the local Historic District Guidelines and the Secretary of Interior Standards. The example motion includes ways the request can better comply with these standards.

If the HDC does not have enough information (type of roofing, design of hipped-roof canopy alterations, plans show a different type of sidewalk covering, etc.) to make a decision, then deferral of the request to the next meeting is appropriate.

ATTACHMENTS:

- [Exhibit 1 - Vicinity map 7.9.25.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 2 Conditions of Approval 7.18.25.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 3 - Cover Letter 7.15.25.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 4 - Photos of Current Condition 7.15.25.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 5 - Photos of Proposed Designs 7.15.25.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 6 - Historic Picture.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 7 - 2004 Historic Resource Survey Excerpt.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 8 - National Register Excerpt.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 9 - Guidelines for Commercial Buildings.pdf](#)
- [Exhibit 10 - HDC Guidelines 119 sec of interior stds.pdf](#)

PROPOSED MOTION:

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations (Exhibit 3) to 101 North Center Street, subject to the conditions in Exhibit 2.

CONTACT INFORMATION:

Applicants/Property Owners

Mark A. McMinn
Amanda G. McMinn
101 North Center Street
Collierville, TN 38017
901-651-7200
mark@dyerscfe.com

Project Planners

Jaime W. Groce, AICP
Nandita Banik
Planning Division
500 Poplar View Parkway
Collierville, TN 38017
901-457-2360
jgroce@collierville.tn.gov
nbanik@collierville.tn.gov