

REPORT TO THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: October 23, 2025

SUBJECT: Case #252464 - 177 W. South Street - Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) for Demolition

INTRODUCTION:

- Sheila McCarley is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic District Commission (HDC) for the demolition of the principal structure & the accessory structure on the south side of the property (see Exhibit 1 & 6).
- The property is zoned R-3: High Density Residential and is surrounded by other R-3: High Density Residential properties.

BACKGROUND:

- The single-family dwelling property is within the Collierville Local Historic District, but is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places (see Exhibit 9).
- This structure is shotgun-style architecture built circa 1930, but inappropriate renovations in 2000 largely diminished its architectural integrity per a recent survey.
- Collierville has had Historic Design Guidelines and a local Historic Overlay since 1989. Incrementally, residential structures are disappearing from the local overlay; records show 27 dwellings have been lost since 1991 (see Exhibit 10).

KEY POINTS:

1. The applicant wishes to demolish the two (2) existing structures and construct a new building (see Exhibit 3).

- The owner intends to reconstruct the property as per the Historic District Guidelines requirements, stating renovation is no longer cost-effective.
- The accessory structure would also be demolished, but the applicant has not stated if a new one will be constructed.
- The current request is for demolition only.
- The applicant also states an existing tree will be removed. The Town does not regulate tree removal on residential lots less than an acre.

2. Appendix V. D. of the Historic District Design Guidelines says demolition is appropriate if the building has lost architectural/historical integrity, and removal won't harm the district visually; it does not contribute to the district, and removal improves visual effect; or, denial causes economic hardship, as determined by the HDC (see Exhibits 7 & 8).

3. The applicant believes the structure has lost its architectural and historic integrity.

- The applicant states there was also an addition of vinyl window, synthetic vinyl siding, and a front porch with the lattice railing (see Exhibit 5), which are not consistent with the HDC's Guidelines.
- The applicant has provided pictures (exterior & interior) taken during inspections and appraisal

- reports (see Exhibit 5) along with a survey report (Exhibit 6).
- The applicant has not submitted any possible renderings of the proposed replacement buildings yet.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Demolition is appropriate since the buildings do not have architectural or historical integrity and importance. Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of both structures, as the request is consistent with the Guidelines for Demolition of Historic Buildings (Exhibit 8).

ATTACHMENTS:

[Exhibit 1 - Vicinity Map.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 2- Example Conditions of Approval.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 3 - Cover letter.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 4 - Plot Plan.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 5 - Exterior & Interior Pictures.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 6 - Survey work.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 7 - Economic Hardship.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 8 - HDC's Guidelines on Demolition and Relocation.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 9 - 177 W. South Street - 2005 Historic Survey.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 10 - Historic District Demolitions Map \(1991-Present\).pdf](#)

PROPOSED MOTION:

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the structures located at 177 W South Street, subject to the conditions in Exhibit 2.