

REPORT TO THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: September 24, 2026

SUBJECT: Case #262261 -177 W. South Street - Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) for New Construction

INTRODUCTION:

- Property owner Sheila McCarley is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) for a new dwelling located on the south side of W. South Street (see Exhibits 4, 5, & 7).
- This 0.17-acre property is one (1) of four (4) properties rezoned in July 2026 from R-3: High Density Residential to TN: Traditional Neighborhood via Ordinance 2026-07. Adjacent properties to the east and west are now zoned TN.
- The subject property is within the Local Historic Overlay, but not within the National Register District and is not eligible for the National Register per the Town's latest historic resources survey.

BACKGROUND:

- The property currently contains an existing one-story residential structure constructed circa 1930 and a detached shed. In October 2025, the Historic District Commission (HDC) conditionally approved the demolition of these structures, finding they did not have historic significance.
- The TN Zoning District allows for smaller required building setbacks than R-3, which was the main reason for the 2026 rezoning request.

KEY POINTS:

1. The TN District has “form based” bulk requirements (setbacks, height, lot size, etc.) especially designed to allow the type of development envisioned by the Downtown Collierville Small Area Plan.

- The 56-foot+/- wide lot is not wide enough to be subdivided into multiple street-loaded lots due to the TN District's 50-foot minimum lot width. The lot does not have a rear service alley/drive.
- New single-family homes constructed in the TN District must comply with the Single-Family Design Standards of § 151.210, which are intended to produce dwelling types similar to recent new dwellings to the east of the Town Square, unless there is a conflicting provision in the HDC Guidelines, in which case the Guidelines would apply.

2. The proposed home incorporates architectural elements commonly found within the local historic district, including a prominent front dormer, varied rooflines, carriage house garage door, and a covered front porch comprising over 50% of the front facade.

- Other traditional elements include horizontal lap siding (fibrous cement with five-inch exposure), brick (unpainted), architectural shingles, and standing-seam metal roofing (see Exhibit 2, COA #5).
- The applicant has proposed several color schemes (see Exhibit 7), but the exact choices are not clear. The applicant's design professional states the colors will be warm earth tones with unpainted natural brick.
- The painted front door will be wooden and 3/4 glass with four light pattern. The windows will be

either a double hung or casement Windsor brand in a simulated divided light style. Fixed shutters will be used on the side facades but will need hinges and "shutter dogs" to appear operational.

- When the conditions of approval are addressed, the roof form, materials, texture, color, and decorative elements for the proposed residence will comply with the Historic District Guidelines.

3. The proposed dwelling meets the Historic District Guidelines for complexity of form, directional expression, height and width, and scale (see Exhibits 5 & 7).

- The proposed width of the 1.5-story dwelling is approximately 45 feet and has a height of 22 feet (measured halfway up the slope of the roof).
- A front porch (approximately 25 feet wide and 8 feet deep) provides human scale. Most of the dwellings on this block have wide front porches.
- The finished floor elevation of the front elevation is raised above grade, which is required and maintains a historic character (see Exhibit 2, COA #4).

4. The proposed side yard setbacks meet the requirements of the TN District although it is unclear if the setback of the dwelling complies with the front façade zone requirement and HDC

Guidelines for contextual building placement. Revisions to the plot plan (see Exhibit 2, COA #4).

- Page 33 of the HDC Guidelines say, "new construction should be located between 85 and 115 percent of the average front setback distance of the existing historic structures on the same block face as the proposed new construction. Setback measurements should exclude porches one-third or less the length of the front wall of the house and be rounded to the nearest whole number. Ultimately, it is the responsibility of the HDC to determine the contextual and appropriate front set back on a block and which existing structures are appropriate to include or exclude from the measurement." §151.027(D) also lets the HDC set the front yard setbacks.
- Many of the houses on South Street have minimal side yard setbacks. The TN minimum side setback of five (5) feet is appropriate on this block.

5. The attached, front-facing garage appears to extend in front of the dwelling's "centerline" if it is measured at the tallest side-facing gable near the front of the dwelling (see Exhibit 2, COA #2).

- The Historic District Guidelines state new garages should be located to the rear of the main house, or it should be placed to the side of the main house without extending in front of its centerline. The Guidelines do not have a clear definition of centerline, leaving the HDC to decide on a case-by-case basis.
- §151.210 (applicable in the TN District) requires street-facing garages to be a minimum of 20 feet behind the front facade of the dwelling they serve (excluding any porches, stoops or bay windows), but this requirement does not apply in this situation as the HDC Guidelines expressly address garage setbacks.
- Front-facing garages with a shallow setback are inappropriate for the local Historic Overlay and not found on W. South Street.
- Few dwellings on this block face have garages. None are attached or front-facing. Parking occurs on driveways, the public street, or occasionally lawns. Ordinance 2026-03, once adopted will prohibit parking on lawn areas.
- The HDC needs to decide how the centerline of this dwelling is determined and whether the front-facing garage placement is appropriate.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Deferral of the CofA for the dwelling is recommended to the October 2026 HDC meeting so HDC feedback can be given on the measurement of the centerline of the dwelling, the front façade zone, and the applicant's options for exterior materials and finishes, and the application materials revised accordingly. If the HDC decides during the deliberation these matters have been addressed, the example conditions of approval (Exhibit 2) should be applied in the motion.

ATTACHMENTS:

Exhibit 1 - Vicinity Map.pdf

Exhibit 2 Conditions of Approval 9-16-26.pdf

Exhibit 3- McCARLEY Survey 9-4-26.pdf

Exhibit 4- McCARLEY Plot Plan 9-4-26.pdf

Exhibit 5- McCARLEY House Plans 9-4-26.pdf

Exhibit 6- McCARLEY Floor Plans 9-4-26.pdf

Exhibit 7- 177 W South St color scheme 9-3-26.pdf

PROPOSED MOTION:

(Per Applicant's request): To approve the applicant's request (Exhibits 4, 5, & 7) for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new dwelling at 177 W. South Street, subject to the conditions in Exhibit 2.