

## REPORT TO THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

**DATE:** May 28, 2026

**SUBJECT:** Case #261138– 253 Natchez Street – Request for a Certificates of Appropriateness (CofAs) for Demolition

### INTRODUCTION:

- The applicant, Carson Looney, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (CofA) from the Historic District Commission (HDC) for the demolition of the principal structure and the accessory structure on the south side of the property (see Exhibits 1 & 11).
- The property is zoned R-1 Low Density Residential and is surrounded by other R-1: Low Density Residential and TN: Traditional Neighborhood properties.

### BACKGROUND:

- The single-family dwelling is within Collierville's Local Historic District but is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places (individually or part of the National Register District)
- The 2004 and 2020 Historic Resources Surveys both concluded the dwelling is not eligible for the National Register (see Exhibit 9). The accessory structure was not listed in either survey, suggesting it also does not have significance.
- The principal structure is traditional-style architecture built in 1915, but inappropriate renovations overtime diminished architectural integrity.
- The applicant states there is also an accessory structure on the property constructed in 1946 in poor, deteriorated condition and has no historical significance.
- There is a separate application to rezone the property from R-1 to TN. The Planning Commission (PC) recommend approval on May 7th 2026, to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen (BMA). The upcoming BMA Public Hearing for the rezoning is scheduled for June 8th, 2026.

### KEY POINTS:

1. **The applicant proposes to demolish two (2) existing structures and construct a new building (see Exhibit 4).**
  - The owner cites renovation of the existing dwelling as no longer cost-effective and intends to construct the new dwelling in compliance with Historic District Guidelines requirements.
  - This request addresses the two (2) demolitions only. The applicant has not submitted plans for the proposed new dwelling or accessory structure.
  - Should the HDC grant the rezoning to TN and the CofA for demolition, the new home must comply with the Single-Family Design Standards, which are intended to produce dwelling types similar to recent new dwellings east of Town Square, such as Stratton Heights, Homewood Place, and The Twinings.
2. **Appendix V.D. of the Historic District Design Guidelines establishes Guidelines for Demolition and Relocation of historic buildings (see Exhibit 8).**
  - Given the purpose of historic zoning is to protect historic properties, demolition of a building contributing historically or architecturally to the character and significance of the district is inappropriate and staff recommends it be avoided.
  - Demolition is inappropriate if:

- A building holds sufficient architectural or historical interest and value, making its removal detrimental to the public interest;
    - A building is of such age, unusual or uncommon design, or rare materials as to make reproduction impossible or requiring great difficulty and expense; or
    - The proposed replacement would make a lesser positive visual contribution to the district, would disrupt the character of the district, or would prove visually incompatible.
  - Demolition is appropriate if:
    - A building has lost its architectural and historical integrity and importance, and its removal will not result in a more negative or less appropriate visual effect on the district;
    - A building does not contribute to the historical or architectural character and importance of the district, and its removal will result in a more positive and appropriate visual effect on the district; or
    - Denial of the demolition will result in economic hardship to the applicant as determined by the Collierville Historic District Commission (see Exhibit 6 for this process).
    - Should the HDC determine demolition appropriate, Exhibit 9 provides guidelines for demolition and documentation of the building per Historic American Building Survey standards (see Exhibit 8).
- 3. **Applying the Guidelines for Demolition of Historic Buildings, staff finds demolition of the primary structure and accessory structure appropriate, as both structures have lost their architectural and historical integrity and importance.**
- 4. **The applicant has submitted exterior and interior photographs from an inspection, an appraisal report (see Exhibit 5), and a survey report (see Exhibit 6) documenting both the primary structure and accessory structure have lost their architectural and historical integrity.**
- 5. **Collierville has maintained Historic Design Guidelines and a local Historic Overlay since 1989; however, residential structures within the overlay continue to decline in number. Since 1991, records indicate the loss of 36 dwellings — six (6) of which appear on the National Register District's nomination form — along with approximately 45 accessory structures (see Exhibit 9).**

#### **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:**

**Primary Structure (Dwelling):** Staff recommends approval of the demolition as it is consistent with the Guidelines for Demolition of Historic Buildings. The 2004 and 2020 Historic Resources Surveys both concluded the dwelling is not eligible for the National Register (see Exhibit 9).

**Accessory Structure (Detached Garage):** Staff recommends approval of the demolition as it is consistent with the Guidelines for Demolition of Historic Buildings. The 2004 and 2020 Historic Resources Surveys both did not note the accessory structure as being significant (see Exhibit 9).

#### **ATTACHMENTS:**

[Exhibit 1 - Vicinity Map and Contact Information \(4.21.26\) .pdf](#)

[Exhibit 2 - Example Conditions of Approval PS 05.19.26.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 3 - Example Conditions of Approval AS 05.19.26 .pdf](#)

[Exhibit 4 - Cover Letter 05.21.26.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 5 - Exterior and Interior Pictures 05.05.26.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 6 - Property Inspector Letter 02.06.23.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 7 - Economic Hardship.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 8 - HDC's Guidelines on Demolition and Relocation.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 9 - 253 Natchez Street -2005 Historic Survey.pdf](#)

[Exhibit 10 - Historic District Demolitions Map \(1991-Present\).pdf](#)

[Exhibit 11 - Plot Plan 05.05.26.pdf](#)

**PROPOSED MOTION:**

**MOTION 1:** Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the primary structure located at 253 Natchez Street, subject to the conditions in Exhibit 2.

**MOTION 2:** Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the accessory structure located at 253 Natchez Street, subject to the conditions in Exhibit 3.